



**STUDIJŲ KOKYBĖS VERTINIMO CENTRAS**

**ŠV. IGNACO LOJOLOS KOLEGIJOS  
VEIKLOS VERTINIMO IŠVADOS**

---

**INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW REPORT  
ST. IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA COLLEGE**

Grupės vadovas:  
Team leader:

Prof. Bob Munn

Grupės nariai:  
Team members:

Dr Jonas Bartlingas

Prof. Dr. Bastian Bauman

Ms Jolita Čeičytė

Doc. Dr. Julius Griškevičius

Dr Anneli Lorenz

Vertinimo sekretorius:  
Review secretary:

Dr Norma Ryan

## CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION.....	3
II. BACKGROUND INFORMATION ABOUT THE INSTITUTION.....	4
III. STRATEGIC MANAGEMENT .....	5
IV. ACADEMIC STUDIES AND LIFE-LONG LEARNING .....	9
V. RESEARCH AND (OR) ART .....	10
VI. IMPACT ON REGIONAL AND NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT .....	12
VII. GOOD PRACTICE AND ENHANCEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS .....	13
VIII. JUDGEMENT .....	15
ANNEX 1. ST. IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA COLLEGE RESPONSE TO REVIEW REPORT....	16

## I. INTRODUCTION

1. This report describes a review of St. Ignatius of Loyola College (the College) carried out in 2013 by a team of experts from Lithuania and other European countries (the team). The team was invited by the Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education (SKVC), Lithuania, as an Authorized Agency prescribed by Lithuanian law to evaluate and accredit Lithuanian higher education institutions. The review was conducted in accordance with the prescribed methodology pursuant to the Procedure for External Reviews in Higher Education, approved by Government Resolution No. 1317 of 22 September 2010, and the Methodology for Conducting an Institutional Review in Higher Education, approved by the order of the Director of SKVC No 1-01-135 on 25 October 2010.
2. The College provided the team with a Self-Evaluation Report (SER) supported by detailed annexes in advance of the site visit. The SER had been prepared by a group that included a student as well as representatives of external academic and social partners. The SER covered the information required to prepare the team for its visit to the College and was presented in a clear format, particularly in mapping College goals and activities against external goals. However, the SER did not always try to evaluate the activities it described.
3. Before visiting the College, members of the team reviewed the SER with its annexes, commenting on the points it made and the questions it prompted. Additional information was requested and supplied in advance of the site visit, and further documentation was supplied during the visit. The team was provided with other background documentation, including an evaluation of learning resources by MOSTA. This visit took place over the three days 7 – 9 May 2013, and included a tour to review facilities and twelve formal meetings.
4. The review team consisted of the following members.
  - Professor Bob Munn (U.K., team leader): independent consultant on quality in higher education, emeritus professor of chemical physics and formerly Vice-President for Teaching and Learning at the University of Manchester, with experience of reviewing institutions in the U.K., Lithuania, South Africa and Saudi Arabia.
  - Dr. Jonas Bartlingas (Lithuania, employer representative): Head of Health Care Resources Management Division, Ministry of Health; Lithuania.
  - Professor Bastian Baumann (Germany): independent consultant on higher education and formerly Secretary General of the Magna Charta Observatory, Bologna, Italy, with experience of reviewing institutions in Lithuania and across Europe.
  - Ms Jolita Čeičytė (Lithuania, student representative): Masters student in Knowledge and Innovation Management, Kaunas University of Technology.
  - Associate Professor Dr Julius Griškevičius (Lithuania): Head of Department of Biomechanics, Faculty of Mechanics, Vilnius Gediminas Technical University.
  - Dr Anneli Lorenz (Estonia): Head of the Department of Academic Affairs, Estonian University of Life Sciences, Tartu, with experience of reviewing institutions in Estonia.
  - Dr Norma Ryan (Ireland, review secretary): formerly Director, Quality Promotion Unit, University College Cork, with experience of reviewing institutions in Ireland, Lithuania, Sweden, Tanzania and the Netherlands.

The team was supported by an SKVC evaluation coordinator.

## II. BACKGROUND INFORMATION ABOUT THE INSTITUTION

5. Located in Kaunas City, the College is a non-state higher education institution founded in 2010 by three parties: the Kaunas Archbishopric, the Province of Lithuanian Jesuits, and the JSC Orthopaedic Clinic. These three founders are the owners of the College as equal shareholders or stakeholders, and serve as its governing body; henceforth in this report they will be referred to as the Governors. There is provision to add more shareholders, but so far this has not been needed.
6. Although the College is a new foundation, it builds on a strong and long-standing relation with the Kaunas Vocational Training Centre (KVTC). This Centre had a general interest in how competences developed in its programmes could provide a basis for higher study, and established a route for students in orthopaedic technology to progress to higher education programmes offered in collaboration with other institutions. Problems with recognition meant that these programmes had to be ended, and the foundation of the College served to re-establish this progression route. The JSC Orthopaedic Clinic supported the foundation because of its need for suitably qualified staff, also experienced by similar enterprises nationwide.
7. The two religious organizations supported the foundation of the College in order to make available higher education with a distinctive Christian ethos and an emphasis on human values. These features give the College a distinct ethos to which staff, students and social partners all testified during the visit.
8. The partners concerned with founding the College continue to support it in various ways. KVTC acts as a source of students, of ideas for possible programme developments and of teaching support, and is so intermeshed with the College that there has been a suggestion that both bodies should share a building. Similarly the Jesuit secondary schools in the area provide a source of students attracted by the College's ethos. The religious organizations inform and support the development of programmes of study that address the Church's social concerns and embody a concern for the whole person, for example a newly-approved social work programme has been developed that is designed for people who will work in parishes in rural areas; the religious organizations have also provided financial support for some extra-curricular activities. The JSC Orthopaedic Clinic supplies technical input, offers opportunities for projects, and gives financial support to students.
9. The College teaches and fosters Christian values both within and alongside the curriculum. It seeks to provide knowledge and cultivate skills and to develop students' ability to realize their professional, Christian and human vocation. Consistent with its title, it actively adopts the educational paradigm of St Ignatius of Loyola, which encourages active participation by students in the learning process so that as they acquire knowledge they also have their faith reinforced and their values shaped. The College aims to combine this paradigm harmoniously with public needs within the European Higher Education Area so as to foster community spirit and the values of both teachers and students.
10. Programmes of study are offered for first-cycle Professional Bachelor's degrees in three areas: Orthopaedic Technologies and Beauty Therapy in the Health Department, and Image Design in the Arts Department; a programme in Social Work had just been accredited at the time of the team's visit. In the academic year 2012–13 there were approximately 130 students studying at the College. The programmes all seek to provide transferability of

competences from vocational training into higher education studies where they can be developed to a higher level.

11. When the self-evaluation report was written, the College had 23 employees, all part-time, of whom 13 were teachers and 14 were administrators (some were both), although at the time of the visit the team met some newly appointed part-time teaching staff bringing the total to 20. Hence as an institution of higher education the College is very small. This helps it to be cohesive and facilitates communication, but limits the scope for academic cross-fertilization and for economies of scale in providing learning opportunities.

### III. STRATEGIC MANAGEMENT

12. The Director determines the strategic direction of the College with the Governors. The Governors appoint the Director and approve his annual report. The strategic purposes of the College are also discussed by the Academic Council (see below, paragraph 25).
13. The current strategic plan runs from 2012–20. It asserts that the tasks put forward in the EU Lisbon strategy – investment into human resources, lifelong learning and the creation of information society – are associated with the vision and mission of the College, which also support the requirements of the draft National Education Strategy. There was no direct evidence provided as to how the strategy is actively aligned with national and European goals: the College’s vision and mission are said to be directly related to some broad European standards, but it was not clear to the team how far that is by design. Overall, the College strategy does not obviously proceed from national and European goals but rather seems to check what overlap there may be after it has been formulated. The team found that the Strategic Plan is in line with the mission of the College. However, the mission is fairly broad so that it might prove difficult for the College to clearly focus its strategic development around it.
14. The Strategic Plan provides detailed analyses of the College’s situation, both internally and in the external environment. It goes on to present strategic goals and tasks, which it builds into a detailed implementation programme with goals, tasks, tools, and expected outcomes in 2016 and 2020 (quantified where appropriate). In addition, the team noted that students are actively involved in creating and shaping the whole strategy, including the mission.
15. On the whole the indicators in the Strategic Plan are well chosen. However, some are insufficiently ambitious. For example, “To introduce innovative study forms” classes distance learning and modular curricula as innovative when they are standard in the majority of higher education institutions worldwide and are merely new to the College. Furthermore, the Plan seeks to have drawn up plans for modular programmes by 2016 that are only being implemented by 2020. Modularity is a core feature of so much higher education that there is plenty of background information that would enable plans to be drawn up and implemented within a couple of years, so that all programmes could be modular in all years by 2020. During the visit, the team learned that although these plans remain unchanged, one programme was already being run in modular form. This shows that the process of modularization can be implemented quite rapidly, and the team therefore encourages the College to accelerate the modularization of all its programmes. In particular, all new programmes should be modular, including the one just approved in social work.

16. Similarly, the plan includes “the development of an information system for the management of activities of the College, including a quality assurance system” but this is not planned to be completed by 2016. This seems too leisurely a pace of change: the team **recommends** that the College should implement these management information and quality assurance systems as a matter of urgency.
17. As discussed in more detail later (Paragraphs 45, 46, 48, 49), there is an urgent need for the College to improve strategic planning regarding research activities and policies of the College.
18. According to the Strategic Plan the leadership of the College supervises the implementation of the strategic plan, assesses the results at the end of each year, analyses the emerging problems and proposes an action plan to resolve them. Where priorities change, the plan is updated. The Governors and the Director make decisions on reviewing and improving the strategy; a strategic planning group assesses research findings and formulates proposals for review of the strategy; and departments are responsible for analysing the environment and recording and assessing developments. However, the College recognizes that monitoring the procedures and their timing would improve the implementation of the strategic plan, and the Director’s report for 2012 is largely descriptive. The team endorses the College’s evaluation that in this area the procedures need to be strengthened.
19. The team **recommends** that the Strategic Plan should be accompanied by a detailed Action Plan in order to ensure the efficient operationalization of its strategy. The Action Plan should be accompanied by a structured follow-up process that allows for an adaptation of the strategy and its accompanying action plan within the timeframe of the Strategic Plan. This is especially important in case the predicted development of the College does not work out; this would therefore offer the possibility of developing alternative plans. The Action Plan should be reported on to the Governors and updated on an annual basis.
20. There is quite wide engagement with the implementation of the strategic plan, as outlined above, and the implementation is discussed in the annual report of the Director submitted for approval to the Governors. In preparing the annual report the Director is able to use inputs obtained by reviewing performance with all members of staff individually: it is important to realise that strategic management is the responsibility of all staff within the College and not just senior management. Information is also made available to the Academic Council (see below), but although the academic community and the public are informed when opportunities arise, this is done in a fragmented manner rather than systematically. Some channels for targeted dissemination are considered, but those that are free are prioritized. The team **recommends** that the College should introduce a systematic method of informing all interested parties about its progress each year, perhaps through appropriate dissemination of the Director’s annual report.
21. Overall, the Strategic Plan is well constructed but some goals are not very ambitious and implementation is patchy, while dissemination of information to interested parties is not very systematic. Strategic planning generally needs to be better focused, and is inadequate in the area of research.
22. The College has a broad-based system of quality management based on the EFQM model (but states it is now moving to ISO 9001 as a basis) and an academic quality assurance system based on the ESG. However, it is not clear how conformity with these frameworks is

ensured. As already noted, the Strategic Plan includes an ambition to develop an information system to assist with the management of activities. Thus it is clear that the College itself believes that its quality assurance system needs improvement in this respect. There is a detailed specification of the information management system, and how this relates to the nine key criteria of the quality assurance system, five relating to processes and organization, and four to results.

23. The College plans to produce a technical manual describing relevant quality assurance procedures and responsibilities, which will also stress the concept of a quality culture to which all members are committed. In discussion with members of the College, the team learned that a quality management process is already in place and working effectively. However, production of the manual is being deferred until after the first students have graduated and moved into employment, because only then can all the performance indicators that the quality process requires be collected and analysed. In the view of the team, the current quality management process and supporting documentation are fit for purpose, and the team encourages the College to consider whether any additional benefit from introducing the quality manual justifies the additional effort.
24. Within the overall quality assurance structure, the College Consultant is responsible for growing the quality culture and leads the Quality Laboratory, which operates a systematic process to ensure quality that focuses on the College's values. Monthly meetings across the whole staff and student community seek feedback about issues related to studies and other matters, leading to discussions about the steps to be taken to resolve problems. The College believes that this process ensures the practical involvement of staff, students and other stakeholders in the process of quality assurance. It is not clear where other stakeholders come in, except perhaps through the Director's annual report, to which all units contribute evaluations of their activities. With multiple lines of reporting, the quality assurance structure is rather complex for the small size of the college, but on the other hand the small size makes the monthly meetings feasible, and students confirm that it meets their needs.
25. An important role in quality assurance and in the organizational structure of the College is played by the Academic Council. Private colleges are not required to have such a body, and the College Statute does not mention it, but on the advice of the Director the Governors appointed the Academic Council to discuss, advise and make recommendations on academic matters. It has nine members, including one student and two external members. The student representative was elected but the others were appointed for five years in the first instance. Members of the Academic Council were hopeful that when their term of office was completed, their replacements might be elected rather than appointed.
26. The Academic Council approves formal matters such as the quality management system, the programmes of study, and the academic ethics code, and will select the best graduation papers for dissemination. The Director's report for 2012 refers to the Academic Council as "a self-governance organ". As such it fulfils a valuable role, although it seems to be more reactive than proactive. In order to establish this role more securely within the College, the team **recommends** that the composition and terms of reference of the Academic Council should be further formalized and secured, perhaps by modifying the Statute.
27. In summary, the quality assurance system needs to be brought explicitly into line with the requirements stemming from the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ESG). It is advisable that the College should commence a process of self-assessment

regarding its alignment with Part 1 of the ESG and devise a plan for implementation of any elements found lacking.

28. The College is not pro-active in process management, while acknowledging that this would help to optimize the information management system that is to be introduced. The Strategic Plan is drafted and revised, but other processes “will be described” in the quality manual. This approach is not sufficient, and improvements should not have to wait for the introduction of the quality manual, the need for which the team queries (see paragraph 23). The team **recommends** that the College should introduce procedures to assure itself that it takes decisions effectively.
29. The College has so few staff (all part-time) that human resource management is necessarily a modest and developing activity. The College has a template to assess staff qualifications and appoints by a rather leisurely process of cultivation that includes an interview six months before employment starts. The MOSTA analysis indicates that the composition, structure and qualifications of the teaching and administrative staff at the College do not reach the expected minimum levels in four out of six areas. The team queried what action the College is taking or plans to take to rectify this, but was unable to find evidence of a long-term staffing plan or of any systematic discussion of the relative advantages of full-time and part-time staff, although the College expressed an ambition to have some full-time staff as it grows. The team therefore **recommends** that the College should as a matter of priority strengthen its staffing base. Nevertheless, staff who met the team spoke very positively about their association with the College and indicated that they willingly work beyond their contracted hours without additional pay.
30. Processes for change management, process analysis and optimization are rudimentary but sufficient for such a small college. However, the team **recommends** that these processes should be supplemented by an explicit process for risk management, even on a small scale.
31. The College has a rational process of accounting for resources and relating them to strategic objectives. The outcomes are reported to the Governors. Financial management is conducted satisfactorily in relation to implementing the Strategic Plan and reviewing the outcomes.
32. The College has a wide-ranging Code of Academic Ethics that reflects its Christian ethos. An Academic Ethics Commission oversees the application of the code, although so far there are no violations to report. The team **commends** these arrangements as reflecting not only broad academic expectations but also the expectations of the College’s own special culture.
33. In summary, the College’s strategic management is better at planning and discussing than at acting, evaluating, and disseminating to the broader community. The arrangements are also sometimes rather complex for such a small institution. There is an urgent need for a management information system to support a developing quality culture, especially if the College grows as planned and monthly meetings of all staff and students no longer prove feasible. It is important to start to establish appropriate structures now in order to allow for a smooth transition as the College grows. The College also needs to strengthen its staffing base.

Strategic Management is given negative evaluation.



#### IV. ACADEMIC STUDIES AND LIFE-LONG LEARNING

34. The College aims to train practice-oriented professionals for the Professional Bachelor's degree. It expects that graduates will be able to help implement the country's regional policy, and that they will realize their vocation, embrace Christian values, choose meaningful goals and work to support other people. The College offers three programmes, all in applied areas (one of them – reflecting the interests of one of the three Founders – being unique in Lithuania), one has just been approved, and more are planned. These programmes fit appropriately the College's Strategic Plan and the needs of the region and the nation. The College reacts rapidly and flexibly to market needs. However, differences in the curricula of vocational education and of the education provided by the College must be made clearer and more transparent. The team **recommends** that the College should define the intended learning outcomes of the curricula more clearly, in line with the Lithuanian Qualifications Framework, and further **recommends** that it should clearly distinguish higher professional education curricula from vocational education curricula. At present, co-operation between curricula is confined to basic subjects and should be broadened. For the effective management of curricula, the team **recommends** that the College should form curriculum committees, or Boards of Study.
35. The College encourages active learning that reinforces students' faith and shapes their values. It implements some flexible forms of learning appropriate for life-long learning and suitable to its size and vocational orientation, but it has not yet developed procedures for assessment and recognition of prior non-formal and informal learning, although there is an acceptance that this is necessary to align with the Bologna process. The team **recommends** that the College should review the transfer of credit points from vocational education to higher education and develop appropriate regulations for such transfers.
36. The MOSTA analysis shows that the adequacy and availability of the College's learning resources and associated infrastructure do not reach the expected minimum levels in any of the eight areas. The College has been slow to adopt information and communication technologies, and the team **recommends** that it should as a matter of priority strengthen its engagement with modern technology in teaching.
37. The College has no graduates yet but is developing plans to monitor the employment of future graduates systematically. The team heard evidence that the College is developing a system that will ensure the systematic collection of data in the future.
38. For its size, the College identifies a rather long list of social and business partners. It collaborates with national HEIs, mostly in sharing their resources; with foreign HEIs for exchanges and projects; and with other partners for training, placements, projects, funding and curriculum development. The College depends heavily on cooperation with its various partners and engages actively with them. The team **recommends** that the College should identify the key partners with whom it will develop permanent cooperative relationships and mutual plans, which will help to provide a basis for the future sustainability of the College.
39. The College has produced a commendably clear and detailed mapping of its documentation against EHEA expectations. Despite its small size the College reports that its staff have attended external conferences, that it has hosted two students from Latvia, and that it plans to add further foreign collaborations. However, it would be advisable to increase lecturer mobility in line with international expectations. To ensure the sustainability of life-long

learning in the College it is necessary to examine the duties and expectations for the heads responsible for the curriculum and the individual lecturers. It is necessary to increase the number of full-time lecturers, who will then be tasked with participation in the development of curricula.

40. The team found that learning in the College is commendably student-centred and considerate of the needs of learners, providing them with assurance and motivation. There was clear evidence that students have the facility to give feedback individually about their studies through surveys and other means. Although staff are only part-time, students confirmed that they were readily contactable.
41. The College contributes to international exchanges and activities, and in particular has attracted some international students to the College. This approach is to be commended. However no evidence was provided about the efficiency of this activity which happens at present only through personal contacts. It is not yet strategically planned but rather happens opportunistically.
42. The College has a very specific focus on the desirability of graduates acquiring Christian values, and this was referred to at different times by all those who met the team as very important and central to the mission of the College. However, students are not compelled to participate in Christian activities such as prayers before classes and become observant Christians. Students can easily participate in such activities if they wish, because activities are scheduled at times when students are free from other commitments within the College, but there is no requirement to attend.
43. Overall, the area of academic studies and lifelong learning is small in scope because the College is new and small, with few students and no graduates yet. For the same reason, it has not yet developed professional education programmes for professionals in activities related to its programmes of study. The area of academic studies and lifelong learning is generally well-conceived and planned and is situated appropriately in respect of national and international expectations, although it lacks the range of learning resources expected in modern higher education. Relations are very good with students and with social partners.

Academic Studies and Life-Long Learning is given positive evaluation.

## V. RESEARCH AND (OR) ART

44. The College's priorities in these areas were originally stated to be (i) Analysis of models and methods of the services business sector and (ii) Improvement of the quality of provision of educational services. The programmes of study it offers are in the service sector, so the first priority is broadly relevant, and the second is relevant to the College's core business of education. However, staff who met the team presented four more specific priorities: health, social welfare, art, and management. Neither set of priorities is directed towards the disciplines that are taught in the programmes, although one member of staff has produced artistic outputs relevant to one programme. The team **recommends** that the College should encourage applied research and (or) art that focus on the core disciplines that it teaches and hence support its programmes of study.

45. Applied research that contributes towards the College priority areas has mostly been conducted by staff who are also PhD students of partner institutions. In discussion with staff and social partners the team learned that the College serves as a test-bed for different methodological approaches developed as part of educational research at partner institutions. However, this research is not emphasized in the strategic plan, and it would be advisable for the College to define clearer boundaries between its own research activities and those of its partners. The College intends to employ full-time staff as it expands, and they will need to be supported with research facilities, but its strategic planning did not seem to allow for long-term research activities. Nevertheless, the current College teachers are very active in participating in or initiating projects at both regional and international levels.
46. The College's priorities in applied research and (or) art align with various local, regional and national priorities, as do staff dissertations. The College is also engaged in projects, mostly in its broad priority areas, although its involvement in areas such as sustainable tourism and rural development does not always seem to relate directly to its priorities or to its current programmes of study. It has engaged in four projects directly aligned with the orthopaedic technology programme. The College considers orthopaedic technology to be one of its strongest research areas, which has led to development of new orthopaedic products and international patent applications by the founder company JSC Orthopaedic Clinic. However, the precise involvement of the College is not clear, and is not reflected in its list of publications or in its activity reports. The role of JSC Orthopaedic Clinic as a key partner in supporting the Orthopaedic Technology programme is undeniable, but the research projects it initiates focus more on the company needs such as qualification of personnel, better infrastructure, and new product development. Hence this is another area in which the College needs to define more clearly what counts as its own research and to take suitable credit for it. Student involvement in this research is currently rather small, and it would be desirable to offer them more opportunities to take part, since the company has the necessary facilities and could provide possible examples for final-year projects. The College's two other programmes of study are related to art, and two students of Beauty Therapy have been successful in local competitions.
47. The College has mapped College documents against general expectations of the European Research Area. This mapping is broadly persuasive. College staff have taken part in a range of international projects, though the nature and extent of their participation is not specified. There is both inward and outward mobility of researchers, but the impact of this mobility is not evaluated. In respect of projects and international mobility, as noted earlier, the topics do not always align with the College's priorities or the programmes of study it offers.
48. Staff have published steadily in peer-reviewed journals, predominantly in the area of vocational training and predominantly in Lithuanian journals, although about half of the publications are in a Lithuanian journal that belongs to a European network. However, the publications are not easy to find and verify, and the College website does not provide any information regarding research results, although this information is reflected in the Director's annual reports. The College plans to develop a system for tracking publications, which is important to provide transparency and a clear vision of the College's aims in directions of research. The majority of publications in the years 2010–12 were in the field of vocational training, consistent with the main research areas of staff working at the college. Although the publications put forward as coming from the College had College staff as authors, the affiliations of these authors were most often given as other partner institutions, so that the reader would not know there was any connection to the College. The team

**recommends** that the College should establish a clear policy on when staff should use its name as their affiliation on publications. The team also encourages the College to benchmark its research by seeking to publish in international journals.

49. Overall, the research and art activities undertaken by the College staff are necessarily small in scale but surprisingly wide in scope. This may be because the College claims all the activities of its staff, whether or not those activities are conducted in the fraction of time they work for the College, but the result is a diversity that is not obviously helpful to the College's mission. Given the small size of the College, the team again **recommends** that it should focus its research and art more tightly in the areas of its programmes of study. The team also **recommends** that the College should improve its strategic planning of applied research and art through defining more clearly what research it claims as its own, developing a policy on publications, and considering how it will support its own long-term research activities.

Research and Art is given positive evaluation.

## VI. IMPACT ON REGIONAL AND NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

50. The College describes mechanisms of impact, i.e. how impact is to be achieved through what it does, rather than ways of measuring and hence evaluating the impact of what it does. The activities identified are worthwhile and are consistent with national and regional goals, but they are not very specific. As a small institution, the College might benefit from concentrating on a more tightly focused set of activities.
51. In terms of effectiveness, the College lists specific activities with little evaluation except to report that its training of professionals in orthopaedic technology is welcomed, as might be hoped because this programme reflects the interests of one of its three Founders. The College also notes that the programme is unique in Lithuania and for that reason has been granted 15 funded places by the Government, a positive feature that the College could stress more. The work in floristry clearly contributes positively to local celebrations. The College actively searches for companies to fund places for students with the aim that graduates will gain employment in those companies.
52. The College has mapped its activities more specifically against the national, regional and local plans. Clearly a small College cannot be expected to contribute significantly, but it is noticeable that none of its activities maps directly onto external plans for the development of ICT and the knowledge economy. This is consistent with the finding by MOSTA that the College's provision of learning resources including ICT is inadequate, and the team again **recommends** that the College should strengthen its engagement with modern technology in teaching and research in order to support regional and national development.
53. It is too early in the College's life for training practice and graduation projects to be significant, except for making students aware of local enterprises. The first graduates are due in spring 2014. The College has entered into some discussion on the plans for projects for the students as they enter their final year, although the information provided is not very specific. However the staff of the College recognize the value and importance of such projects, both for the learners and for the local enterprises that will engage with them. It will

be easier to evaluate the impact of such activities once a few cycles of students have graduated.

54. The College staff participate widely in voluntary activities at local, regional, national and some international levels. In a sense, this is a strength of the College's use of part-time staff: it can benefit from all their activities, whether or not carried out directly for the College, even though there is only a small number of full-time equivalent staff.
55. Overall, the College has only a modest impact on regional and national development, but that is to be expected of a small institution that has not been in existence for many years. It would be helpful if the College acknowledged explicitly that it cannot expect to have the same range and depth of impact of other institutions that are a hundred times larger and significantly older. The wide engagement of College staff in voluntary activities is noteworthy, but reflects the fact that they are all part-time employees – in effect, their total engagement should be scaled by the fraction of the time for which the College employs them. It was evident that the College has very good support from social partners, but has not yet developed significant ongoing collaborations with them. All those interviewed expressed awareness of the potential value of such collaborations. The team **recommends** that the College should formalize its collaboration with social partners, with future graduates, municipalities, employers, and other potential partners, perhaps using a careers centre as a focus for this activity.

Impact on Regional and National Development is given positive evaluation.

## VII. GOOD PRACTICE AND ENHANCEMENT RECOMMENDATIONS

56. The team commends as **good practice** the following
- The College's development of niche programs that are unique in Lithuania and allow progression from vocational courses to higher education (Paragraphs 10, 34,51)
  - The College's Code of Academic Ethics and Academic Ethics Commission that reflect both broad academic expectations and the College's own special culture. (Paragraph 32)
  - The manner in which the College maps its strategic documents against those of external agencies to assure itself that its strategies are suitable to meet expectations. (Paragraphs 38, 39, 52)
  - The College's ethos and support that produce students who are happy and pro-active in the implementation of its vision (Paragraph 40)
  - The College's active search for companies to fund places for students with the aim that graduates will gain employment in those companies (Paragraph 51)
57. The team **recommends** that the College should
- implement management information and quality assurance systems as a matter of urgency (Paragraph 1616)
  - prepare a detailed Action Plan to ensure the efficient operationalization of its Strategic Plan (Paragraph 19)
  - introduce a systematic method of informing all interested parties about its progress each year (Paragraph 20)
  - formalize the composition and terms of reference of the Academic Council (Paragraph 26)
  - introduce procedures to assure itself that it takes decisions effectively (Paragraph 28)

- strengthen its staffing base (Paragraph 29)
- supplement its processes for change management, process analysis and optimization by an explicit process for risk management (Paragraph 30)
- define the intended learning outcomes of the curricula more clearly, in line with the Lithuanian Qualifications Framework (Paragraph 34)
- clearly distinguish higher professional education curricula from vocational education curricula (Paragraph 34)
- strengthen the supervision and management of each study programme, including the establishment of Boards of Study (Paragraph 34-34)
- review the transfer of credit points from vocational education to higher education and develop appropriate regulations for such transfers (Paragraph 35)
- strengthen its engagement with modern technology in teaching and research (Paragraphs 36, 52)
- identify the key partners with whom it will develop permanent cooperative relationships and mutual plans (Paragraph 38)
- encourage research and art that focus on the core disciplines that it teaches (Paragraphs 44, 49)
- establish a clear policy on when staff should use its name as their affiliation on publications (Paragraph 48)
- improve its strategic planning of research and art (Paragraph 49)
- formalize its collaboration with social partners, future graduates, municipalities, employers, and other potential partners (Paragraph 55)

## VIII. JUDGEMENT

58. St. Ignatius of Loyola College is given **negative** evaluation.

Grupės vadovas:  
Team leader:

Prof. Bob Munn

Grupės nariai:  
Team members:

Dr Jonas Bartlingas

Prof. Dr. Bastian Bauman

Ms Jolita Čeičytė

Doc. dr. Julius Griškevičius

Dr Anneli Lorenz

Vertinimo sekretorius:  
Review secretary:

Dr Norma Ryan

# ANNEX 1. ST. IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA COLLEGE RESPONSE TO REVIEW REPORT



## ST. IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA COLLEGE OF HIGHER EDUCATION

2 Jablonskio St., LT- 44286 Kaunas, tel. (8 37) 20 02 60. Fax. (8 37) 55 29 64.

Data is collected and stored in the Register of Legal Entities. Code 302485644

---

To: Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education

17-06-2013

No. SD

-54

### WITH REFERENCE TO THE DRAFT CONCLUSIONS OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION OF THE INSTITUTION

We are sincerely grateful for the draft conclusions of the external evaluation of St. Ignatius of Loyola College of Higher Education. However, some factual errors have been noticed in the draft conclusions, which we would like to be considered before making the decision:

1. Regarding the data provided by MOSTA .

To carry out external evaluation of St. Ignatius of Loyola College and in order to achieve objective results, not only the data for the year 2011 is to be considered but also the data for the year 2012 as well as the whole period of the activities of the college. The evaluation of performance was conducted in 2013 while the evaluation of real resources was conducted on 8 August, 2012 and self-assessment on 4 February, 2013. Therefore, we think that the assessment without taking into account the 2012 data is not objective and does not reflect the true state of the college. We would also like to draw your attention that the 2012 college resources comply with the regulatory indicators (supplements 1 ir 2). Furthermore, the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Lithuanian Republic of 26 January 2012, No. V-175 2.2 p. indicates, that the external evaluation of St. Ignatius of Loyola College is to be conducted taking into consideration the whole period of the existence of the college of higher education.

SKVC ( the Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education) draft conclusions along with other sources are based on MOSTA conclusion No. Sp-IR-23/12, 08 August, 2012. SKVC draft



conclusions, items 29 and 36 state that the indicators of the performance do not meet minimum requirements. This conclusion is incorrect as it is based on the data of the year 2011. St. Ignatius of Loyola College was registered as a legal entity on 2 March, 2010. The permission to conduct studies and activities related to studies was issued on 26 May, 2011, based on the order No. V-918 of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Lithuania. MOSTA conclusion reflects only a seven-month period of the College activities, therefore, the tangible results of the 19-month period of the college activities are not objectively evaluated. It is reasonable to assume that the object of the evaluation should be learning activities rather than the pre-study period.

## 2. With regards to the conclusions of the evaluation

The shortcomings presented in the supplement 3 are groundless as the additional material submitted during the external evaluation of the college was not taken into consideration. The request from SKVC (the Centre for Quality Assessment in Higher Education) to submit some additional material was received on 8 April, 2013. On 3 May, 2013 we replied that documents were to be submitted during the visit. It was done but has remained unassessed.

We would like you to take into consideration the arguments presented above as well as not only the year 2011, but also 2012 real resources indicators and the data provided in the supplements before making a decision on St. Ignatius of Loyola College.

### SUPPLEMENTS:

1. St. Ignatius of Loyola College resource data for the year 2012 (submitted by MOSTA), 1 page.
2. St. Ignatius of Loyola College comparative analysis of resources for the year 2011 and 2012 (submitted by MOSTA), 1 page.
3. Factual discrepancies, 2 pages.
4. The list of documents presented during the visit.

Yours faithfully,

Director

Aivaras Anužis

## St. Ignatius of Loyola resource data for the year 2012 (submitted by MOSTA)

<i>Indicator</i>	<i>Standard indicator estimate</i>	<i>Factual score</i>	<i>Compliance</i>
13.1 BPPR - Gross floor area per student indicator	Min 11,7	13,7	Complies
13.2 PARU - Buildings and facilities renewal indicator	Min 23,3	24,8	Complies
13.3 TIAR - Technology (artistic creation) equipment renewal indicator	Min 268,8	280,4	Complies
13.4 BFAR - Library (libraries) fund renewal indicator	Min 20	25,1	Complies
13.5 BDVR Libraries (libraries) physical employment indicator	Max 26,8	6,3	Complies
13.6 BKDVR - Libraries (libraries) computerized workplaces indicator	Max 242,2	31,4	Complies
13.7 BevR - High School general floor area covered by wireless connection indicator	Min 50	58	Complies
13.8 IIR - Information technology resource renewal indicator	Min 53,8	124,2	Complies
13.9 Average funds per student in a study area indicator	Min 70	100	Complies
15.1 The number of students per teacher indicator	Max 18,4	41,9	Does not comply
15.2. The number of students per one employee providing support in study and research activities indicator	Max 40,8	25,1	Complies
15.3. The ratio of lecturers with a scientific degree (recognized artists) employed in the institution to the total amount of teaching posts occupied	Min 5	50	Complies
15.4. The ratio of part-time lecturers, i.e. working additionally in their spare time to the total amount of teaching posts occupied	Max 65	58,3	Complies
15. The ratio of higher school administration along with other staff employed in the institution to the total amount of teachers and researchers .	Max 60	57,8	Complies
15.6. The ratio of higher school administration along with other personnel to the total number of full- time students.	Max 25	1,5	Complies
16.1. The ratio of the students who discontinued their studies to the total number of students.	Max 34,2 Min 4,7	11,1	Complies
16.3. Competitive scores by study programmes of the students admitted to the first study cycle and integrated studies	Min 60	100	Complies

St. Ignatius of Loyola College comparative analysis of resources for the year 2011 and  
2012 (data submitted by MOSTA)

<i>Indicator</i>	<i>2011 evaluation</i>	<i>2012 evaluation</i>	<i>Evaluation change</i>
13.1 BPPR - Gross floor area per student indicator	8,3	13,7	has improved
13.2 PARU -Buildings and facilities renewal indicator	0	24,8	has improved
13.3 TIAR - Technology (artistic creation) equipment renewal indicator	0	280,4	has improved
13.4 BFAR - Library (libraries) fund renewal indicator	0	25,1	has improved
13.5 BDVR - Libraries (libraries) physical employment indicator	-	6,3	cannot be compared
13.6 BKDVR- Libraries (libraries) computerized workplaces indicator	-	31,4	cannot be compared
13.7 BevR -- High School general floor area covered by wireless connection indicator	0	58	has improved
13.8 IIR - Information technology resource renewal indicator	0	124,2	has improved
13.9 Average funds per student in a study area indicator	-	100	cannot be compared
15.1. The number of students per teacher indicator	17	41,9	has deteriorated
15.2 The number of students per one employee providing support in study and research activities indicator	51	25,1	has improved
15.3. The ratio of lecturers with a scientific degree (recognized artists) employed in the institution to the total amount of teaching posts occupied	0	50	has improved
15.4. The ratio of part-time lecturers, i.e.working additionally in their spare time to the total amount of teaching posts occupied	66,7	58,3	has improved
15.5. The ratio of higher school administration along with other staff employed in the institution to the total amount of teachers and researchers .	100	57,8	has improved
15.6. The ratio of higher school administration along with other personnel to the total number of full- time students.	7,8	1,5	has improved

16.1. The ratio of the students who discontinued their studies to the total number of students.	-	11,1	cannot be compared
16.3. Competitive scores by study programmes of the students admitted to the first study cycle and integrated studies	100	100	no change

## Factual discrepancies

Points of conclusions	Discrepancy
<p><b>2. Part 3.”Strategic management“, p.13</b>            ...”the strategy of the college has not been prepared in accordance with national and European targets”</p>	<p>The data were submitted in the college self-assessment report, part 3, table 2; the Strategic Plan of the College p.2.1.1, the Strategic Programme of the College for 2012-2020, Objective 5; during the visit of the evaluation commission, additional documentation on the internal quality assurance process was submitted ("Relevance of Quality Assurance in Accordance with the European Standards and Guidelines ").</p>
<p><b>Part 3.”Strategic management“, p.15</b>            “...all new programmes are supposed be modular, including the recently approved social work programme "</p>	<p>All three currently running college programmes are modular - the data was submitted to the evaluation commission during the visit with the additionally presented documents.</p>
<p><b>Part 3.”Strategic management”, p.16</b>            ...the development of the information system including the college management and quality assurance system, as specified in the plan, is not to be completed by 2016. This indicates that the pace of change is too slow.            "</p>	<p>College information system was introduced in trial mode. Some of its functions have been fully implemented (working time, accounting, document management) - the data was submitted to the evaluation commission during the visit with the additionally presented documents..</p>
<p><b>Part 3.”Strategic management”, p.19.</b> “            “... strategic plan should be accompanied by a detailed action plan to ensure the effective strategy of operationalization.”</p>	<p>The recommended action plan is consistent with the quality improvement action plan, which was submitted to the evaluation commission during the visit along with other documents presented.</p>
<p><b>Part 3.”Strategic management”, p.22.</b> "            .”.. the college has a diverse quality management system based on the EFQM model and the study quality assurance system</p>	<p>The application of EFQM model is described in the Quality Management System of the College, page 5-8 (Self-assessment Report, supplement 4).</p>

<p>based on the ESG. However, it is not clear how the compliance with these systems will be ensured".</p>	
<p><b>Part 3."Strategic management", p.24.</b>  "... it is unclear whether stakeholders are involved in activities of the Quality Laboratory ..".</p>	<p>The examples of feedback with stakeholders (employers, graduates, students) were presented to the evaluation commission during the visit along with other documents.</p>
<p><b>Part 3."Strategic management", 27 p.</b> "In conclusion, the quality assurance system must clearly meet the requirements arising from the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ESG)."</p>	<p>The quality assurance system complies with the requirements arising from the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance: the evidence was presented to the evaluation commission during the visit along with other additional documents ("The Effectiveness of Internal Quality System of Studies").</p>

The documents submitted to the evaluation commission during the visit

<b>Title in Lithuanian</b>	<b>Title in English</b>
Pastarųjų 3-jų metų veiklos ataskaitos	Activity Report for the past 3 years
Vidinio kokybės užtikrinimo proceso dokumentai (tvarkos, protokolai, nutarimai)	Internal quality assurance and management documents (regulations, protocols, decisions)
Grįžtamojo ryšio su soc. dalininkais (darbdaviais, absolventais, studentais) pavyzdžiai (anketų, analizių, pristatymų pavyzdžiai)	Feedback from stakeholders (employers, alumni, students) - samples of questionnaires, analysis, presentations.
Dalykų/modulių aprašų pavyzdžiai (skirtingų sričių)	Description of various curriculum programmes / modules (different areas)
Tarybos, senato (akademinės tarybos) posėdžių protokolų pavyzdžiai.	Minutes of Council and Academic council meetings
Stojamųjų egzaminų užduotys	Entrance exam tasks
Konferencijų dokumentai	Conference documents
Projektai	Projects\

## ANNEX 2 : EXPERTS' REMARKS ON NEW EVALUATION OF LEARNING RESOURCES BY MOSTA

After the team had completed its review and final report, SKVC brought to the team's attention a report dated 21 June 2013 from MOSTA on its most recent evaluation of the learning resources at St Ignatius of Loyola College. This report evaluated the learning resources positively, whereas the report dated 8 August 2012 that was available to the team during its review evaluated the learning resources negatively.

The team welcomes this improvement in the indicators and the change to a positive evaluation. However, this new information does not change the team's overall evaluation, which remains negative because of the team's negative evaluation of the area Strategic Management.